Standard 1: Foundations of Government, Law, and the American Political System

SS.5.C.1.6

Compare Federalist and Anti-Federalist views of Government.

How did the Federalist and the Anti-Federalist views of government differ?

Teacher Note: These lessons should be taught in conjunction with American history benchmarks to add historical perspective to these important civics understandings.
Concerns about Power Given to the National Government under the *U.S. Constitution*: The Federalists v. Anti-Federalists

The group that favored the new federal *Constitution* was called the “Federalists”. They argued that the separation of powers and checks and balances system created in the new *Constitution* protected the people. No one group could control the other two. The Federalists also argued that the *Constitution* lacked a specific listing of rights, which, in their view, actually protected the people because a list of protected rights might indicate that rights that were not included on such a list were not rights, and could be violated.

The group that opposed the new federal *Constitution* was called the “Anti-Federalists” who expressed several arguments against it. These arguments included their concern that the *Constitution* gave too much power to the national government at the expense of the state governments, the *Constitution* lacked a specific listing of rights needed to protect the people from the national government.

The Anti-Federalists were especially concerned that the “necessary and proper” clause (also called the “elastic clause”) gave too much power to Congress. The “necessary and proper” clause is found in Article I, Section 8 of the U.S. Constitution. It allows Congress to do what it believes is “necessary and proper” in order to carry out its other responsibilities. The Anti-Federalists were also concerned that the executive branch held too much power.

**The Addition of the Bill of Rights as Compromise**

The first nine states ratified the new *Constitution* in 1788, within the first nine months after it was completed in September 1787. It was not until 1790 that Rhode Island agreed to support the new document. Still, the Anti-Federalists’ concerns did have an impact, as in 1791, state legislatures voted to add the first 10 amendments to the *Constitution*. These 10 amendments are, together, called the *Bill of Rights*. This means that the new federal Constitution was ratified without a bill of rights although soon after all states ratified the document, the *Bill of Rights* was added to the *Constitution*. Both the Federalists’ desires for a federal system, and the Anti-Federalists’ concerns about the absence of a bill of rights, were both addressed by 1791. The *Bill of Rights* represents a compromise between the Federalists and the Anti-Federalists in that it enumerated the specific protections that the Anti-Federalists were so concerned were missing from the *Constitution*. The *Bill of Rights* also demonstrates that the Federalists kept their promise to the Anti-Federalists by insuring that the new Congress of the federal government considered enumerating specific protections.

---

1 This content also covers American History Benchmark SS.5.A.5.10: Explain the significance of the Constitution including its key political concepts, origins of those concepts, and their role in American democracy.
Common Core State Standards
Grade 5 English Language Arts, Reading: Literature

Key Ideas and Details

RL.5.1. Quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text.

RL.5.2. Determine a theme of a story, drama, or poem from details in the text, including how characters in a story or drama respond to challenges or how the speaker in a poem reflects upon a topic; summarize the text.

RL.5.3. Compare and contrast two or more characters, settings, or events in a story or drama, drawing on specific details in the text (e.g., how characters interact).

Craft and Structure

RL.5.4. Determine the meaning of words and phrases as they are used in a text, including figurative language such as metaphors and similes.

RL.5.5. Explain how a series of chapters, scenes, or stanzas fits together to provide the overall structure of a particular story, drama, or poem.

RL.5.6. Describe how a narrator’s or speaker’s point of view influences how events are described.

Integration of Knowledge and Ideas

RL.5.7. Analyze how visual and multimedia elements contribute to the meaning, tone, or beauty of a text (e.g., graphic novel, multimedia presentation of fiction, folktale, myth, poem).

RL.5.8. (Not applicable to literature)

RL.5.9. Compare and contrast stories in the same genre (e.g., mysteries and adventure stories) on their approaches to similar themes and topics.

Range of Reading and Complexity of Text

RL.5.10. By the end of the year, read and comprehend literature, including stories, dramas, and poetry, at the high end of the grades 4–5 text complexity band independently and proficiently.
Common Core State Standards
Grade 5 English Language Arts, Reading: Informational Text

Key Ideas and Details

RI.5.1. Quote accurately from a text when explaining what the text says explicitly and when drawing inferences from the text.

RI.5.2. Determine two or more main ideas of a text and explain how they are supported by key details; summarize the text.

RI.5.3. Explain the relationships or interactions between two or more individuals, events, ideas, or concepts in a historical, scientific, or technical text based on specific information in the text.

Craft and Structure

RI.5.4. Determine the meaning of general academic and domain-specific words and phrases in a text relevant to a grade 5 topic or subject area.

RI.5.5. Compare and contrast the overall structure (e.g., chronology, comparison, cause/effect, problem/solution) of events, ideas, concepts, or information in two or more texts.

RI.5.6. Analyze multiple accounts of the same event or topic, noting important similarities and differences in the point of view they represent.

Integration of Knowledge and Ideas

RI.5.7. Draw on information from multiple print or digital sources, demonstrating the ability to locate an answer to a question quickly or to solve a problem efficiently.

RI.5.8. Explain how an author uses reasons and evidence to support particular points in a text, identifying which reasons and evidence support which point(s).

RI.5.9. Integrate information from several texts on the same topic in order to write or speak about the subject knowledgeably.

Range of Reading and Level of Text Complexity

RI.5.10. By the end of the year, read and comprehend informational texts, including history/social studies, science, and technical texts, at the high end of the grades 4–5 text complexity band independently and proficiently.
Common Core State Standards
Grade 5 English Language Arts, Reading: Language

Vocabulary Acquisition and Use

L.5.4. Determine or clarify the meaning of unknown and multiple-meaning words and phrases based on grade 5 reading and content, choosing flexibly from a range of strategies.

- Use context (e.g., cause/effect relationships and comparisons in text) as a clue to the meaning of a word or phrase.
- Use common, grade-appropriate Greek and Latin affixes and roots as clues to the meaning of a word (e.g., photograph, photosynthesis).
- Consult reference materials (e.g., dictionaries, glossaries, thesauruses), both print and digital, to find the pronunciation and determine or clarify the precise meaning of key words and phrases.

L.5.5. Demonstrate understanding of figurative language, word relationships, and nuances in word meanings.

- Interpret figurative language, including similes and metaphors, in context.
- Recognize and explain the meaning of common idioms, adages, and proverbs.
- Use the relationship between particular words (e.g., synonyms, antonyms, homographs) to better understand each of the words.

L.5.6. Acquire and use accurately grade-appropriate general academic and domain-specific words and phrases, including those that signal contrast, addition, and other logical relationships (e.g., however, although, nevertheless, similarly, moreover, in addition).
Common Core State Standards
Grade 5 English Language Arts, Reading: Writing

Text Types and Purposes

W.5.1. Write opinion pieces on topics or texts, supporting a point of view with reasons and information.

- Introduce a topic or text clearly, state an opinion, and create an organizational structure in which ideas are logically grouped to support the writer’s purpose.
- Provide logically ordered reasons that are supported by facts and details.
- Link opinion and reasons using words, phrases, and clauses (e.g., consequently, specifically).
- Provide a concluding statement or section related to the opinion presented.

W.5.2. Write informative/explanatory texts to examine a topic and convey ideas and information clearly.

- Introduce a topic clearly, provide a general observation and focus, and group related information logically; include formatting (e.g., headings), illustrations, and multimedia when useful to aiding comprehension.
- Develop the topic with facts, definitions, concrete details, quotations, or other information and examples related to the topic.
- Link ideas within and across categories of information using words, phrases, and clauses (e.g., in contrast, especially).
- Use precise language and domain-specific vocabulary to inform about or explain the topic.
- Provide a concluding statement or section related to the information or explanation presented.

W.5.3. Write narratives to develop real or imagined experiences or events using effective technique, descriptive details, and clear event sequences.

- Orient the reader by establishing a situation and introducing a narrator and/or characters; organize an event sequence that unfolds naturally.
- Use narrative techniques, such as dialogue, description, and pacing, to develop experiences and events or show the responses of characters to situations.
- Use a variety of transitional words, phrases, and clauses to manage the sequence of events.
- Use concrete words and phrases and sensory details to convey experiences and events precisely.
- Provide a conclusion that follows from the narrated experiences or events.

Production and Distribution of Writing

W.5.4. Produce clear and coherent writing in which the development and organization are appropriate to task, purpose, and audience. (Grade-specific expectations for writing types are defined in standards 1–3 above.)

W.5.5. With guidance and support from peers and adults, develop and strengthen writing as needed by planning, revising, editing, rewriting, or trying a new approach.
W.5.6. With some guidance and support from adults, use technology, including the Internet, to produce and publish writing as well as to interact and collaborate with others; demonstrate sufficient command of keyboarding skills to type a minimum of two pages in a single sitting.

**Research to Build and Present Knowledge**

W.5.7. Conduct short research projects that use several sources to build knowledge through investigation of different aspects of a topic.

W.5.8. Recall relevant information from experiences or gather relevant information from print and digital sources; summarize or paraphrase information in notes and finished work, and provide a list of sources.

W.5.9. Draw evidence from literary or informational texts to support analysis, reflection, and research.

- **Apply grade 5 Reading standards** to literature (e.g., “Compare and contrast two or more characters, settings, or events in a story or a drama, drawing on specific details in the text [e.g., how characters interact]”).

- **Apply grade 5 Reading standards** to informational texts (e.g., “Explain how an author uses reasons and evidence to support particular points in a text, identifying which reasons and evidence support which point[s]”).

**Range of Writing**

W.5.10. Write routinely over extended time frames (time for research, reflection, and revision) and shorter time frames (a single sitting or a day or two) for a range of discipline-specific tasks, purposes, and audiences.
Civics Content Vocabulary

Teacher Note: Preteach vocabulary words and definitions. As a vocabulary extension following the lesson, have students complete the chart for each word providing examples and non-examples (if applicable) and a gesture/visual/symbol for each word.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Word</th>
<th>Definition</th>
<th>Example</th>
<th>Non-Example</th>
<th>Gesture/Visual/Symbol</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>*Anti-Federalist</td>
<td>a member of the group that opposed the adoption of the United States Constitution</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Federalist</td>
<td>a member of a major political party in the early years of the United States that favored a strong central national government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Teacher Note: This is an opportunity to reinforce the meaning of the prefix “anti” meaning “against.”
Instructions for conducting a Read Aloud

Preparing for a Read Aloud:
   1. Select a read aloud text that will provide a springboard for teaching the civics benchmark (See suggested books within this module, but not limited to).

   2. Along with the content civics vocabulary for this module, identify additional vocabulary terms within the selection necessary for text comprehension and understanding the civics benchmark.

   3. Generate questions of varying complexity related to the text that support deeper understanding of the civics benchmark.

   4. Plan opportunities for authentic student engagement with the text during the Read Aloud (text discussion, turn & talk, think-pair-share).

Conducting a Read Aloud:
   1. Introduce the book.

   2. Briefly introduce the predetermined vocabulary words.

   3. During the Read Aloud, conduct think alouds so students are provided a model of thinking that is applied while reading. Use the generated questions to ask students about the text to allow opportunities for authentic student engagement (text discussion, turn & talk, think-pair-share) and to clarify understanding.

   4. After the Read Aloud, provide opportunities for students to discuss and write about civics concepts learned.
Suggested Books

Alexander Hamilton: Federalist and Founding Father by Lisa Decarolis
Survey the life of Alexander Hamilton, a founding father, later becoming the first Secretary

The Federalist-Anti-Federalist Debate over States' Rights: A Primary Source Investigation by Lea Ball
Examines the debate waged between the Federalists and Anti-Federalists in the six months preceding the ratification of the Constitution over the political structure of the new nation and the limits of federal power and states' rights.

The Federalists and Anti-federalists: How and Why Political Parties Were Formed in Young America by Gregory Paya
These titles in the Life in the New American Nation series explore the roots of U.S. government. Beginning with a brief but effective summary of the political divisions that occurred after the Constitutional Convention ended, The Federalist takes off at breakneck speed to follow the evolution of political parties to the present day. At times the pace is too fast. For example, a sidebar mentions the nineteenth century Know-Nothing Party, but fails to explain why the party was formed. Native Americans offers similar strengths and weaknesses. It presents its material in a concise and easy-to-read format, but the information is often so concise that it barely rises above the level of a student's report. The series promises primary sources, yet most of those featured are simply period photographs. Also included are a two-page glossary and a short but adequate index. Young researchers seeking report sources will probably need more than these pamphlet-length books offer, but students with a lower reading level may find useful browsing material here.
Bell Work

Module Objective:
1. The student will compare Federalist and Anti-Federalists views of government.

Activity:

1. Display for the students the image of the Constitutional Convention: 
   http://teachingamericanhistory.org/convention/stearns/
2. Have students respond to the following questions:
   a. What kind of facts do you see in this picture? (for ex., it is a room full of men)
   b. What do you think is happening in the picture?
   c. What does the picture make you wonder?
Guided Practice Activity

Activity:

1. Explain to the students that there were many discussions and compromises that were made as part of the creation of the United States Constitution. Inform them that there were two primary groups working on the issues surrounding the creation of the new nation. They were the Federalists and the Anti-Federalists. The Federalists and the Anti-Federalists had different points of view. It is important to look at both sides of an issue.
2. Pass out the reading passage: Federalists and Anti-Federalists.
3. Provide a modeled read of the passage.
4. Pass out the activity sheet: Federalists/Anti-Federalists.
5. Collaborate, as a whole class, using information from the passage to explain the Federalists’ view. Instruct students to write and explain the Federalists’ view in their own words.
Federalists/Anti-Federalists

Directions: Write in your own words the views of each side.

Federalist

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

Anti-Federalist

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________

________________________________________________________________________
Federalists and Anti-Federalists

The debate over the Constitution entailed conflict and compromise. Even when it was completed, some people were unhappy with it. The task of fixing the ailing Confederate government was not complete yet; each state had to ratify, or approve, the Constitution. Basically, people divided into two groups, the Federalists and the Anti-Federalists. Each of their viewpoints is worth examining, as they both have sound reasoning.

The Anti-Federalists such as James Mason and Patrick Henry did not want to ratify the Constitution. Basically, they argued that:

- It gave too much power to the national government at the expense of the state governments.
- There was no bill of rights.
- The national government could maintain an army in peacetime.
- Congress wielded too much power.
- The executive branch held too much power.

Of these complaints, the lack of a bill of rights was the most effective. The American people had just fought a war to defend their rights, and they did not want an intimidating national government taking those rights away again. The lack of a bill of rights was the focus of the Anti-Federalist campaign against ratification.

The Federalists, such as James Madison and George Washington, had answers to all of the Anti-Federalist complaints. Among them:

- The separation of powers into three independent branches protected the rights of the people. Each branch represents a different aspect of the people, and because all three branches are equal, no one group can assume control over another.
- A listing of rights can be a dangerous thing. If the national government were to protect specific listed rights, what would stop it from violating rights other than the listed ones? Since we can't list all the rights, the Federalists argued that it's better to list none at all.

Overall, the Federalists were more organized in their efforts. By June of 1788, the Constitution was close to ratification. Nine states had ratified it, and only one more (New Hampshire) was needed. To achieve this, the Federalists agreed that once Congress met, it would draft a bill of rights. Finally, New York and Virginia approved, and the Constitution was a reality. Interestingly, the Bill of Rights was not originally a part of the Constitution, and yet it has proved to be highly important to protecting the rights of the people.

Source-Adapted from [http://library.thinkquest.org/11572/creation/framing/feds.html](http://library.thinkquest.org/11572/creation/framing/feds.html)
Application Activity

Activity:

1. Have students work in pairs to write the Anti-Federalist view in their own words using the Federalists and Anti-Federalists passage.
2. Have students share their responses.
Independent Practice Activity

Writing Prompt: Compare and contrast the views of the Federalists and Anti-Federalists.

__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________
## Supplemental Resources and Activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Website</th>
<th>Web Address</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td><a href="http://www.brainpop.com">www.brainpop.com</a></td>
<td>BrainPop – videos and quizzes to build background knowledge (interactive online videos with questions) Search for: Thomas Jefferson, James Madison, John Adams</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Organizing Information

- Sometimes it is easier to understand information if you make lists.

Directions: Organize the information in the box under the correct heading of Federalists or Anti-Federalists.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Strong central government</th>
<th>Strong state governments</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>James Madison</td>
<td>Thomas Jefferson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wanted a Bill of Rights</td>
<td>3 branches sharing power</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thought central government was enough</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Thought executive branch was too strong</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Federalists**

1. 

2. 

3. 

4. 

**Anti-Federalists**

1. 

2. 

3. 

4. 
Collecting Information

- There are many sources available to collect information. Researching topics helps with reading comprehension by building background knowledge.

Directions: Circle a topic to research.

Anti-Federalists  Federalists

Directions: Write three questions to answer about the topic through research.

1. __________________________________________
2. __________________________________________
3. __________________________________________

Directions: Name 4 sources to use to gather information about your topic.

1. __________________________________________
2. __________________________________________
3. __________________________________________
4. __________________________________________
Reading Comprehension

Directions: Read the following information. Then answer the questions in complete sentences.

The people who supported the new Constitution, the Federalists, began to publish articles supporting ratification. Alexander Hamilton, James Madison, and John Jay eventually compiled 85 essays as *The Federalist Papers*. These supporters of the Constitution believed that the checks and balances system would allow a strong central government to preserve states' rights.

Some delegates, however, would not approve the Constitution when it was sent to the states for ratification until it included a bill of rights listing the individual rights of every citizen. So, the Convention promised a bill of rights would be attached to the final version. Several amendments were immediately considered when the first Congress met in 1789. Twelve amendments, written by James Madison, were presented to the states for final approval. Only ten were approved. Those ten make up the Bill of Rights. They are also the first ten amendments to the Constitution.

Source- http://congressforkids.net/Constitution_ratifyingconstitution.htm

1. What were the people who supported the new Constitution called?

2. What compromise did the Federalists make for states to ratify the Constitution?

3. What are the first ten amendments to the Constitution called?
Answer Key

Organizing Information

Federalists

1. Strong central government
2. Alexander Hamilton
3. Thought central government was enough
4. 3 branches sharing power

Anti-Federalists

1. Strong state governments
2. Wanted a Bill of Rights
3. Thought executive branch was too strong
4. Thomas Jefferson

Collecting Information

Answer may vary

Reading Comprehension

1. Federalists
2. Add a bill of rights listing the individual rights of every citizen
3. Bill of Rights